

# Health and Adult Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel

Thursday 24 January 2013

PRESENT:

Councillor Mrs Aspinall, in the Chair.

Councillor Monahan, Vice Chair.

Councillors Mrs Bowyer, Fox, Gordon, James, Mrs Nicholson, Parker, Jon Taylor and Tuffin.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Dr. Mahony and Sue Kelley, Local Involvement Network.

Also in attendance: Sue Stock, Head of Midwifery Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust (PHNT) Imogen Montague, Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist (PHNT), Amanda Nash, Head of Communications (PHNT), Mrs Kerry Dungay, acupuncture service user, Mrs Sarah Budd, retired founder of the Acupuncture Midwifery service, Dr Adrian White, Researcher and Acupuncture practitioner, Nick Pahl, The British Acupuncture Council, Karen Kay, Designate Head of Western Locality Commissioning NEW Devon Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG), Candice Sainsbury, Lead Officer Plymouth City Council (PCC) and Ross Jago, Democratic Support Officer (PCC)

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 4.05 pm.

*Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

## 48. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were made in accordance with the code of conduct -

| Name                    | Minute Number and Issue                                      | Reason   | Interest |
|-------------------------|--|--|----------|
| Councillor Mrs Aspinall | Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust - Maternity Acupuncture Service | Retired Midwife and member of the Royal College of Midwives. | Personal |
| Councillor J Taylor     | Clinical Commissioning Group Authorisation Update            | Clinical Commissioning Group Employee                        | Personal |

49. **CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS**

There were no items of Chair's urgent business.

50. **MINUTES**

Agreed to approve the minutes of the 22 November 2012.

51. **TRACKING RESOLUTIONS AND FEEDBACK FROM THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT BOARD**

The panel noted the tracking resolutions.

52. **PLYMOUTH HOSPITALS NHS TRUST - MATERNITY ACUPUNCTURE SERVICE**

Following a resolution on the 22 November 2012 the panel considered the closure of the Maternity Acupuncture Service at Derriford Hospital.

Sue Stock, Head of Midwifery and Imogen Montague, Consultant Obstetrician and Gynaecologist representing Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust reported that -

- (a) like many of the hospital's services, the maternity service had been undergoing a period of change due to reducing budgets;
- (b) the maternity acupuncture service had been challenged for a number of years and a recent inspection by the National Institute for Clinical Excellence (NICE) had also challenged the validity and continuation of the service;
- (c) the service was unable to guarantee one to one care with every woman in the acute setting and as such all available resource had to be redirected into the acute care setting;
- (d) the research and trials available on the benefits of this kind of acupuncture was poor, inconclusive and did not show benefits over and above a placebo treatment. It was not felt that there was enough evidence to support continued acupuncture service provision in this area;
- (e) commissioners had confirmed that the hospital would not receive a payment over and above the tariff to fund the service.

Mrs Kerry Dungay, previous service user, Mrs Sarah Budd, former acupuncture midwife, Dr Adrian White, Researcher and Acupuncture practitioner and Nick Pahl, Chief Executive of the British Acupuncture Council attending the meeting to speak in support of the closed service. It was reported that –

- (f) the maternity acupuncture service was set up in 1988 initially to deal with pain relief in labor and later developed to deal with serious antenatal problems;

- (g) an online petition had received 1400 signatures and two previous service users had said they would be unable to deal with another pregnancy without the acupuncture service;
- (h) the trust figures on the numbers of service users were misleading and inaccurate;
- (i) the closure of the service was purely a cost saving exercise which would have a significant impact on the care of pregnant women in Plymouth;
- (j) there were many areas of routine care which were not evidence based;
- (k) NICE guidance was retrospective and there was high quality evidence available to support the service;
- (l) acupuncture reduced the pharmaceutical costs for the NHS;
- (m) acupuncture is a main stream provision in health services and is provided in various settings, there were upward of 4.5 million acupuncture treatments per year.

In response to questions from members of the panel it was reported that –

- (n) the numbers stated in the Trust's report related to first appointments rather than total sessions;
- (o) there was a large number of signatures from patients on the petition but also signatures from people across the country;
- (p) many members of the public would be unable to afford the level of acupuncture required to deal with Hyperemesis Gravidarum;
- (q) although it was stated that acupuncture was cost effective the evidence base was not strong and needed time to be developed;
- (r) the service cost £180 per appointment;
- (s) the Chair of the Maternity Service Liaison Committee had used the service;
- (t) there was £1800 left in the charity account of the acupuncture service and there had not been any income from patients for the service.

Agreed –

- (l) that the NEW Devon CCG Western Locality are requested to consider options for providing Acupuncture Services for women suffering with Hyperemesis Gravidarum in the community or Primary Care settings;

- (2) in the context of the transformation of services, that the panel plans a future review into maternity services provided from Derriford Hospital. The panel will investigate actions which could be taken to enhance antenatal and postnatal service choices which could be provided in other community settings.

53. **CLINICAL COMMISSIONING GROUP AUTHORISATION UPDATE**

Karen Kay, Designate Head of Western Locality Commissioning, NEW Devon Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) provided the panel with a presentation on the authorisation process and possible commissioning intentions.

The panel Agreed to note the presentation and request that the Western Locality Operating Plan is made available to a future meeting of the panel.

*(This agenda item was moved to facilitate better management of the meeting.)*

54. **HEALTH AND WELLBEING BOARD AND STRATEGY UPDATE**

Ross Jago, Democratic Support Officer introduced a briefing paper updating members of the panel on the development of the Health and Wellbeing board and joint health and wellbeing Strategy.

The panel agreed to –

- (1) note the report;
- (2) request that the draft health and wellbeing strategy is presented at a future meeting of the panel;
- (3) recommend to the Shadow Health and Wellbeing Board that the Devon and Somerset Fire and Rescue Service is invited to become a member.

55. **WORK PROGRAMME**

Agreed to delegate to the Lead Officer, in consultation with the Chair and Vice Chair, the preparation of a new work programme which better reflects the panel's place in the new health system, ensuring that joint working between health and social care services and commissioning for prevention is adequately scrutinised.

56. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of Chair's urgent business.